

Available online at www.sciencedirect.com



Biological Control

Biological Control 45 (2008) 11-20

www.elsevier.com/locate/ybcon

# Use of native range surveys to determine the potential host range of arthropod herbivores for biological control of two related weed species, *Rhamnus cathartica* and *Frangula alnus*

André Gassmann<sup>a,\*</sup>, Ivo Tosevski<sup>a</sup>, Luke Skinner<sup>b</sup>

<sup>a</sup> CABI Europe—Switzerland, Rue des Grillons 1, CH-2800 Delémont, Switzerland <sup>b</sup> Minnesota Department of Natural Resources, 500 Lafayette Road, Box 25, St. Paul, MN 55155-4025, USA

> Received 5 June 2007; accepted 19 December 2007 Available online 28 December 2007

#### Abstract

The buckthorn species, *Rhamnus cathartica* and *Frangula alnus*, are shrubs and small trees of Eurasian origin that have become invasive in North America. A program was initiated in 2001 to reassess the potential for biological control of these two species taking into consideration increasing concerns over potential non-target impacts of biological control agents. The key question was whether *R cathartica* and *F. alnus* are distantly enough related that they would not share the same arthropod complex in Europe, and, if so, which arthropod species would be less likely to use native North American buckthorns as hosts. Some 1000 insect samples collected at 99 sites in Europe indicated that the arthropod-species richness is higher on *R. cathartica* than on *F. alnus* and includes more species that are presumed to be host-specific at the species or genus level. This discrepancy supports the hypothesis that the genus *Rhamnus* in the temperate Old World has evolved in isolation of the genus *Frangula* in the Neotropics and that taxonomic isolation has an effect on species, Acarina (4 species) and Coleoptera (1 species). At least 12 arthropod species were found exclusively on *Rhamnus*, some of which may be specific to *R. cathartica*. Several species usually associated with *Rhamnus* were found rarely on *F. alnus* but the field host range of these species still needs to be confirmed. Only one species was found exclusively on *F. alnus* at this stage. However, additional field surveys may reveal other host-specific agents available for biological control of *F. alnus* at this stage. However, additional field surveys may reveal other host-specific species.

© 2008 Elsevier Inc. All rights reserved.

Keywords: Rhamnus cathartica; Frangula alnus; Buckthorn; Biological control; Species richness; Food niche; Center of origin; Taxonomic isolation; Host plant phylogeny

# 1. Introduction

*Rhamnus cathartica* L. (common buckthorn) and *Frangula alnus* Miller (glossy buckthorn) (Rhamnaceae) are two shrubs and small trees of Eurasian origin which have become invasive in North America.

*Rhamnus cathartica* is found throughout Europe, but is absent from most parts of Scandinavia and the Iberian Pen-

\* Corresponding author. Fax: +41 32 421 4871.

E-mail address: a.gassmann@cabi.org (A. Gassmann).

insula, and from the extreme south (Tutin, 1968; http://linnaeus.nrm.se/flora/di/rhamna/rhamn/rhamcat.html). The species is also present in European Russia, in south-western Siberia, in the northern Caucasus as well as in the Province of Xinjiang in China (D. Jianqing, personal communication, 2001). In Europe, *R. cathartica* prefers mesic to mesic-dry, warm open or half-shaded habitats. It grows in well drained calcareous alkaline or neutral soils, but it can also be found occasionally in swampy areas (Rameau et al., 1989).

*Rhamnus cathartica* was introduced to North America as an ornamental shrub in the late 1800s and was originally used for hedges, farm shelter belts, and wildlife habitats

<sup>1049-9644/\$ -</sup> see front matter @ 2008 Elsevier Inc. All rights reserved. doi:10.1016/j.biocontrol.2007.12.004

(Gourley, 1985; Randall and Marnelli, 1996; Gale, 2001). It has spread extensively and is currently found in most Canadian provinces (Nova Scotia to Saskatchewan) and 27 states predominantly in the north central and northeastern portion of the United States (Gale, 2001; USDA/NRCS, 2001). *Rhamnus cathartica* invades mainly woodlands and savannas, although it also occurs on prairies and open fields.

*Frangula alnus* has a slightly wider distribution than *R. cathartica* extending from northern Scandinavia in the boreal zone up to the Iberian Peninsula and a southernmost enclave in western North Africa (Tutin, 1968; Scamoni, 1985; Medan, 1994; http://linnaeus.nrm.se/flora/di/rhamna/frang/franaln.html). *Frangula alnus* is also present in European Russia, in south-western Siberia, in the northern Caucasus as well as in the Province of Xinjiang in China (D. Jianqing, personal communication, 2001). In Europe, *F. alnus* prefers mesic to mesic-moist acid soils in open or half-shaded habitats but it can also be found occasionally in dry calcareous stands (Rameau et al., 1989).

*Frangula alnus* was imported to North America prior to the 1900s as horticultural stock for landscape plantings, and has become naturalized in the northeastern US and southeastern Canada (Catling and Porebski, 1994; Randall and Marnelli, 1996; Haber, 1997). Currently, *F. alnus* occurs from Nova Scotia to Manitoba, south to Minnesota, Illinois, New Jersey and Tennessee incorporating 23 states in the US (Converse, 2001; USDA/NRCS, 2001). *Frangula alnus* is most problematic in fens and other wetlands but also can invade uplands and sandy soil forests.

Both species are very adaptable, forming dense thickets that shade and inhibit the growth of native forbs, shrubs, and tree seedlings (Heidorn, 1991; Randall and Marnelli, 1996). Both species are alternate hosts for the fungus, *Puccinia coronata* Corda, which causes oat rust disease (Harder and Chong, 1983; Leonard, 2003). *Rhamnus cathartica* and *F. alnus* are also overwintering hosts for the Asian soybean aphid, *Aphis glycines* Matsumura, a pest of soybean, *Glycine max* (L.) Merrill, which was first recorded in North America in 2000 (Voegtlin et al., 2005). American robins (*Turdus migratorius* L.) nesting in *R. cathartica* experience higher rates of predation than conspecifics nesting in native shrubs (Schmidt and Whelan, 1999).

The systematics of buckthorns has a long history of complexity and uncertainty. Linnaeus described *Rhamnus cathartica* and *Rhamnus frangula* in 1753 (Linnaeus, 1753). In 1754, Miller described the genus *Frangula*, and in 1768, transferred glossy buckthorn to this genus under the name *Frangula alnus* (Miller, 1754/1768). The generic recognition of *Frangula* has been disputed and for many years *F. alnus* has gone under the name *R. frangula* L. A recent molecular study by Bolmgren and Oxelman (2004) supports the generic recognition of *Frangula* used in their study represents a well-supported monophyletic sister clade to the rest of *Rhamnus* in its widest sense. Given the lack of resolution in the *Frangula* clade, *R. cathartica* may be considered more distantly

related to the American *Rhamnus* native community than *F. alnus* is to the American native *Frangula* community.

It is difficult to obtain an accurate count of *Rhamnus* and Frangula species, in particular in the Old World tropics and eastern Palearctic. Grubov (1949) suggested that Rhamnus s.l. consists of almost 200 species but this number was reduced to 125 by Johnston and Johnston (1978). Work by the same authors on Neotropical Rhamnus s.l. suggests that Frangula has an area of diversification in the mountainous areas of the Neotropics with its southern limit in Northern Argentina. Of the 21 species recognized by Johnston and Johnston (1978) in the Neotropics, 20 belong to Frangula and one, Rhamnus serrata Humb. and Bonpl. ex J.A. Schultes, to the genus Rhamnus. In Europe, the genus Rhamnus includes 23 taxa and the genus Frangula includes only four taxa (Tutin, 1968; Hampe et al., 2003). In the United States, Frangula and Rhamnus include five and seven native taxa, respectively, but another two Rhamnus subspecies and 10 Frangula subspecies have been recorded (USDA/NRCS, 2001). Thus, it appears that Rhamnus and Frangula are predominant in the Old World and New World, respectively. In North America, the geographical distribution of the two invasive buckthorn species overlaps most with the native species Rhamnus alnifolia L'Hér., Rhamnus lanceolata Pursh and Frangula caroliniana (Walt.) Gray, making these key-species in host range studies of potential biological control agents.

Research to develop biological control for buckthorns was initiated in 1964. Surveys for potential arthropod biological control agents were carried out mostly in Eastern Austria in summer 1964 and 1965 and preliminary screening tests in 1966-1967 (Malicky et al., 1970). A new program was initiated in 2001 to reassess the potential of biological control of buckthorns with regard to the work carried out by Malicky et al. (1970). In recent years there have been ever-increasing concerns over potential non-target impacts of biological control agents and greater demands for high levels of specificity (e.g. Louda et al., 1997; Pemberton, 2000). The key question was whether R. cathartica and F. alnus are sufficiently distantly related that they would not share the same arthropod complex in Europe and, consequently which arthropod species could be selected for further host range studies, and possibly later on be used for biological control without damaging native North American buckthorns.

The aim of this study was to use both a literature review and field surveys to identify the specialized herbivorous arthropods on *R. cathartica* and *F. alnus* and to determine their host use patterns and preferences in the field. We report results of surveys carried out in Europe in 2002– 2005 and review previous studies on the biological control of buckthorns for North America.

### 2. Materials and methods

Between 2002 and 2005, extensive surveys for presumedspecialized insect species (defined here as a species restricted to one plant genus) on Rhamnus and Frangula spp. were carried out in Switzerland, Germany, Italy, the Czech Republic, Austria, Serbia and Montenegro, More intensive surveys were concentrated in the areas which had been sampled in previous years by Malicky et al. (1970), i.e. eastern Austria, Germany and Switzerland. In Serbia and Montenegro, selective surveys were carried out for a few specific insect species that had not been found in the other surveys. With the exception of the Czech Republic and Italy, most sites were sampled twice per season or more, or at different periods of the year for more than 1 year. Fruits were sampled in 2004–05 only. Leaves, stems and fruits were carefully examined for herbivory and symptoms of herbivory. Immature and mature phytophagous arthropods were handpicked or aspirated from young and mature buckthorn plants. In total, we surveyed R. cathartica and F. alnus at a total of 99 sites and 1000 samples were examined separately. In addition, Rhamnus alpina L. and Rhamnus saxatilis Jacq. were opportunistically surveyed at two and four sites, respectively, as they can co-occur with R. cathartica in the surveyed areas. Juvenile insects were reared on their field host plants in ventilated plastic containers in a shade house. Unhealthy fruits, shoot tips or small branches were collected for dissection or emergence of specific insects. Pheromone traps using a commercial lure developed for Synanthedon myopaeformis (Borkh.) by Plant Research International, Wageningen UR, The Netherlands, were used to detect the presence of the root-boring moth Synanthedon stomoxiformis Hb. The frequency of occurrence of each arthropod collected was calculated for each buckthorn species surveyed. The sampling unit was the whole habitat/site.

### 3. Results

In total, 39 specialized arthopods were recorded from R. cathartica and F. alnus in Europe (Table 1). Lepidoptera (22 species) largely dominated, followed by Hemiptera (8 species), Diptera (4 species), and Acarina (4 species). There was only one specialized beetle species, Oberea pedemontana Chevrolat, recorded on these two buckthorn species in Europe. The feeding guild on R. cathartica and F. alnus was dominated by leaf feeders (18 species), followed by sap-suckers (9 species) and flower or fruit feeders (6 species) of which four species were gall midges reported to induce galls either in the flowers or fruits of buckthorn. In addition to the gall midges, the larvae of Hysterosia sodaliana Haw. developed within the fruits of buckthorn and those of Sorhagenia rhamniella Zeller lived gregariously between spun blossoms of R. cathartica. There were only three shoot/root borers. The larvae of Sorhagenia janiszewskae Riedl developed in the shoot-tips and those of O. pedemontana in the branches. The larvae of S. stomoxiformis mined the roots of buckthorn. Of the leaf feeding phytophages, five species (i.e. Bucculatrix frangutella Goeze, Bucculatrix rhamniella Zeller, Calybites quadrisignella Zeller, Stigmella catharticella Stainton and Stigmella rhamnella H.-S.) mined in the leaves of buckthorn partially or during their entire life cycle. Finally, there were three leaf gall forming species, *Trichochermes walkeri* Foerster, *Trioza rhamni* Schrank and *Phyllocoptes annulatus* (Nal.). Comparatively, Brändle and Brandl (2001) found 29 specialists for a total of 91 herbivores on *Frangula* and *Rhamnus* in a study on herbivore species richness on 25 native trees in Germany.

The number of specialized arthropods was much larger on R. cathartica than on F. alnus. Twenty-two species were mostly associated with R. cathartica and other species in the genus Rhamnus (Tables 1 and 2). Of these 22 species, only eight species have also been occasionally recorded on F. alnus and among those, five consist of literature records, i.e. S. rhamniella, Triphosa sabaudiata Dup., C. quadrisignella, S. rhamnella and H. sodaliana, which were not confirmed during surveys for biological control. However, host affiliations can vary geographically (Fox and Morrow, 1981). For example, S. rhamniella is known from F. alnus in England (Emmet, 1969), an area that was not surveyed for biological control agents. Another eleven species have been found occurring on both R. cathartica and F. alnus. Of those, three species, Ancylis apicella Den. and Schiff., Gonopteryx rhamni L. and S. janiszewskae were found more often on F. alnus than on R. cathartica (Table 2).

The leaf-hopper Zygina suavis Rey was the only species found on *F. alnus* but not on *R. cathartica*, although the literature record list *R. cathartica* as a host of *Z. suavis* (Ossiannilsson, 1981). In addition to *Z. suavis*, literature records indicated another five arthropod species known from *F. alnus*, i.e. Contarinia rhamni Ruebs., Dasyneura frangulae Ruebs., Lygocoris rhamnicolla Reuter, Aristotelia pancaliella Stgr. and Eriophyes rhamni (Pgst.).

Records of presence or absence of most arthropods associated with *R. cathartica* and *F. alnus* in the areas surveyed in Europe in 2002–2005 matched well with those from Malicky et al. (1970) (Table 2). In contrast, the frequency of occurrence of several species differed considerably reflecting a non-random sampling method focussing on pre-selected specialized species in our surveys. *Trichochermes walkeri*, *T. rhamni* and to a slightly lesser extent *Philereme vetulata* Den. and Schiff. and *Triphosa dubitata* L., best represented the specific arthropod community associated with *R. cathartica* in Europe.

Frangula alnus was best represented by Z. suavis, G. rhamni and A. apicella while B. frangutella and O. pedemontana were recorded equally on both buckthorn species. Sorhagenia janiszewskae has been recorded on F. alnus and R. cathartica in Austria only. The occurrence of this species has not been confirmed on R. cathartica in Switzerland and Germany. The frequency of occurrence of most of the other species collected was too low to draw conclusions about host specificity, but our observation matched those of Malicky et al. (1970), indicating that most of the additional species are not associated with F. alnus in the areas surveyed. Table 1

Specialized arthropods associated with *Rhamnus cathartica* and *Frangula alnus* in Europe (\*field records from our surveys; \*\*Malicky et al., 1970; remaining records from literature as indicated)

Species	Host plants	Specificity <sup>a</sup>	Food niche	References
Coleoptera				
Cerambycidae	<b>P</b> cathartica <sup>*</sup> <b>F</b> almus <sup>*</sup>	$\Omega^{2}$	Stem woodboring	Horion (1974): Lakic and Mihailovic (1976):
Oberea peaemontana Chevrotat	R. calnartica , F. anias , R. alpina, Lonicera?	01	Stem, woodboring	Contarini and Garagnani (1980); Baronio et al. (1988); Demelt and Franz (1990); Frisch (1992)
Diptera				
Cecidomyiidae				
Contarinia rhamni Ruebs.	F. alnus	Μ	Gall forming (flowers)	Houard (1909); Barnes (1951); Buhr (1965); Zerova et al. (1991)
Dasyneura frangulae Ruebs.	F. alnus	M	Gall forming (flowers)	Barnes (1951); Buhr (1965)
Lasioptera kozarzewskella Mar. Wachtliella krumbholzi Stelter	R. cathartica R. cathartica <sup>*</sup>	M M	Gall forming (fruits)	Stelter (1975); Zerova et al. (1991) Stelter (1975)
Heterontera	it cumunteu		Gun forming (fruits)	
Miridae				
Heterocordylus erythrophtalmus Hb	R. cathartica <sup>**</sup> , F. alnus <sup>**</sup>	0	Sap sucking	Gollner-Scheiding (1972)
Lygocoris rhamnicola Reuter	F. alnus	М	Sap sucking	Coulianos (1998)
Homoptera				
Aphia commensalis Strovan	<b>R</b> cathartica	м	Gall forming? (leaves)	Buhr (1965): Heie (1986)
Aphis mammulata Gimingh. & HRL	R. cathartica	M	Sap sucking, free living	Heie (1986); Blackman and Eastop (1994)
Cicadellidae				
Zygina suavis Rey	F. alnus <sup>*</sup> /R. cathartica	0	Sap sucking, free living	Ossiannilsson (1981)
Psyllidae				
Cacopsylla rhamnicola (Scott)	R. cathartica <sup>*/**</sup> /F. alnus <sup>**</sup>	0	Sap sucking, free living	Ossiannilsson (1992)
Triozidae				
Trichochermes walkeri Foerster	R. cathartica <sup>*/**</sup>	М	Gall forming (leaves)	Buhr (1965); Okopnyi and Poddubnyi (1983); Meyer (1987); Zerova et al. (1991); Osciannilsson (1992); McL ean (1993)
Trioza rhamni Schrank	<i>R. cathartica<sup>*/**</sup>/F. alnus<sup>**</sup></i>	0	Gall forming (leaves)	Buhr (1965); Ossiannilsson (1992)
Lepidoptera				
Bucculatricidae	*/**/-			
Bucculatrix frangutella Goeze	R. cathartica <sup>*/**</sup> /F. alnus <sup>*/**</sup> /R. alpina <sup>*/**</sup>	0	Leaf miner/leaf chewer	Hering (1957); Heath and Emmet (1985)
Bucculatrix rhamniella HS.	R. cathartica	М	Leaf miner/leaf chewer	Hering (1957); Buszko (1992)
Cosmopterigidae Sorhagenia lophyrella Douglas	R. cathartica <sup>**</sup> /R.	0	Leaf roller	Baran (1997); Malicky et al. (1970)
Sorhagenia janiszewskae Riedl	saxatilis <sup>**</sup> R. cathartica <sup>*/**</sup> /R.	0	Shoot miner	Malicky et al. (1970)
	alpina**/F. alnus*/**/		<b>E</b> 1 <b>C</b> 1	
Sorhagenia rhamniella Zeller	R. cathartica /F. alnus	M?	Flower feeder	Malicky et al. (1970); Emmet (1969)
Gelechiidae			T C I	
Geometridae	F. ainus	IVI	Leaf cnewer	Ivinskis et al. (1982)
Odontognophos dumetata Treitschke	R. cathartica	Μ	Leaf chewer	Forster and Wohlfahrt (1981)
Philereme transversata Hufnagel	R. cathartica <sup>*/**</sup> /R. saxatilis <sup>**</sup> /R.	0		(Skinner, 1984)
Philereme vetulata Den. and Schiff.	orbiculata <sup>**</sup> /F. alnus <sup>**</sup> R. cathartica, <sup>*/**</sup> /R. alpina <sup>**</sup>	0	Leaf chewer	Forster and Wohlfahrt (1981); Skinner (1984)

Table 1 (continued)

Species	Host plants	Specificity <sup>a</sup>	Food niche	References
Triphosa dubitata L.	R. cathartica <sup>*/**</sup> /R. alpina <sup>*/**</sup> /F. alnus <sup>*/**</sup> / Prunus ?/ Fraxinus ?/ Cratagaus ?	O?	Leaf chewer	Blaschke (1914); Forster and Wohlfahrt (1981); Skinner (1984); Jacobi and Menne (1991)
Triphosa sabaudiata Dup.	R. cathartica <sup>**</sup> /R. saxatilis <sup>**</sup> /R. orbiculata <sup>**</sup> /F. alnus/R. alpina	0	Leaf chewer	Blaschke (1914); Forster and Wohlfahrt (1981)
Gracillariidae Calybites quadrisignella Zeller	R. cathartica <sup>*/**</sup> /F. alnus	M?	Leaf miner/leaf chewer	Hering (1957)
Nepticulidae Stigmella catharticella Stainton	R. cathartica <sup>*/**</sup> /R. alaternus	M?	Leaf miner	Hering (1957); Heath (1976); Speight and Cogan (1979); Puplyasis (1984); Puplesis (1994): Michalska (1996)
Stigmella rhamnella HS.	R. cathartica <sup>*/**</sup> /R. alpina <sup>*</sup> /F. alnus	0	Leaf miner	Hering (1957); Puplesis (1994); Michalska (1996)
Pieridae				
Gonopteryx rhamni L.	R. cathartica <sup>*/**</sup> /R. orbiculata <sup>*</sup> /F. alnus <sup>*/**</sup>	0	Leaf chewer	Frohawk (1940); Bergmann (1952); Pollard and Hall (1980); de Freina (1983); Bibby (1983); Rippey (1984); Heath and Emmet (1989); McKay (1991); Gutierrez and Thomas (2000)
Pvralidae				
Acrobasis romanella Mill.	R. cathartica*/R. alaternus**	0	Lchewer	Malicky et al. (1970)
Trachycera legatea Haw.	R. cathartica <sup>**</sup> /R. saxatilis <sup>**</sup>	0	Leaf chewer	Mihajlovic (1978)
Sesiidae				
Synanthedon stomoxiformis Hb.	R. cathartica*/F. alnus*/ Sorbus aria?/Coryllus avelana ?	O?	Root miner	Doczkal and Rennwald (1992); Stadie (1995). Bittermann (1997); de Freina (1997); Spatenka et al. (1999)
Tortricidae				
Ancylis apicella Den. & Schiff.	R. cathartica <sup>*/**</sup> /F. alnus <sup>*/**</sup> /R. alpina <sup>**</sup> / Ligustrum ?/ Cornus ?/ Prunus ?	O?	Leaf chewer	Razowski (2003)
Ancylis derasana Hb. (=unculana Haw.)	R. cathartica <sup>*/**</sup> /F. alnus <sup>*</sup> /Corylus ?/Rubus ?/Populus ?	O?	Leaf chewer	Razowski (2003)
Ancylis obtusana Haw. Hysterosia sodaliana Haw.	R. cathartica/F. alnus R. cathartica**/F. alnus	0 0	Leaf chewer Fruit feeder	Razowski (2003) Hannemann (1964); Razowski (1970)
Acari				
Eriophyidae				
Aceria rhamni Roiv.	R. cathartica	M	Sap sucker, free living	Amrine and Stasny (1994)
Eriophyes rhamni (Pgst)	F. alnus B. cathantic=*	M	Leaf erineum ?	Amrine and Stasny (1994)
Tetra rhamni Roiv.	R. cathartica R. cathartica	M	Sap sucker, free living	Amrine and Stashy (1994) Amrine and Stashy (1994); Petanovic, personal communication (2005)

<sup>a</sup> M, monophagous, restricted to R. cathartica or F. alnus; O, oligophagous, restricted to species in the genus Rhamnus and/or Frangula.

In Serbia and Montenegro, *O. pedemontana* and *S. stomoxiformis* were recorded on *R. cathartica* and *F. alnus*, and *Wachtiella krumbholzi* Stelter reared from the fruits of the former species (Gassmann et al., 2006). According to M. Skuhrava (personal communication, 2005), *W. krumbholzi*, which was known from Northern Germany and the Czech Republic only, can-

not be considered to be cecidogenous, but it is rather a seed feeder.

*Rhamnus cathartica* and *F. alnus* were observed growing sympatrically in 20 sites. Host plant records for 18 arthropod taxa associated with *R. cathartica* and *F. alnus* were similar in allopatric and sympatric sites (Table 3). None of the species known exclusively from *R. cathartica* in allo-

## Table 2

Frequency of occurrence of specialized buckthorn arthropods in 2002-05 in Italy, Austria, Switzerland, Germany and the Czech Rep. (records from Malicky et al. (1970) are presented on shaded columns)

	Rhamnus cathartica			Frangula alnus		
Total # of sites sampled :		52	2	14	47	83
Number of sites with (%): LEPIDOPTERA :				_		
Bucculatricidae :						
Bucculatrix frangutella 4)	7	(13.5)	44	(20.6)	6 (12.8)	11 (13.3)
Cosmopterigidae :						
Sorhagenia janiszewskae <sup>4)</sup>	13	(25.0)	9	(4.2)	14 (29.8)	14 (16.9)
Sorhagenia rhamniella		-	14	(6.5)	-	-
Sorhagenia lophyrella <sup>3)</sup>		-	27	(12.6)	-	-
Gracillariidae :						
Calybites quadrisignella	3	(5.8)	10	(4.7)	-	-
Nepticulidae:						
Stigmella catharticella	2	(3.8)	25	(11.7)	-	-
Stigmella rhamnella <sup>4)</sup>	1	(1.9)	2	(0.9)	-	
Pyralidae :						
Acrobasis romanella <sup>1)</sup>	1	(1.9)				
Trachycera legatea <sup>3)</sup>		-	3	(1.4)	-	-
Pieridae :				/		
Gonoptervx rhamni <sup>2)4)5)</sup>	7	(13.5)	18	(8.4)	21 (44.7)	22 (26.5)
Geometridae				<u> </u>		\
Philereme vetulata <sup>4)</sup>	14	(26.9)	68	(31.8)	-	_
Philereme transversata <sup>2) 3)</sup>	8	(15.4)	38	(17.8)	-	1 (1.2)
Triphosa dubitata <sup>2) 4)</sup>	22	(42.3)	42	(19.6)	-	3 (3.6)
Triphosa sabaudiata <sup>3)</sup>		-	2	(0.9)	-	- (0.0)
Tortricidae				(0.0)		
Ancylis apicella <sup>1) 3) 4)</sup>	5	(9.6)	2	(0.9)	7 (14.9)	2 (24)
Ancylis derasana	6	(11.5)	9	(4.2)	3 (6.4)	()
Cochylidae:		()	Ū	()	• (011)	
Hysterosia sodaliana		-	14	(6.5)	-	
HOMOPTERA				(0.0)		
Psyllidae :						
Caconsylla rhamnicola	5	(9.6)	6	(2.8)	_	1 (12)
Triozidae :	U	(0.0)	Ŭ	(2.0)		1 (1.2)
Trichochermes walkeri	43	(82 7)	67	(16.8)	_	
Trioza rhamni <sup>4)</sup>	36	(69.2)	36	(16.8)	_	1 (12)
Cicadellidae :	00	(00.2)	00	(10.0)		1 (1.2)
Zvaina suavis		_		-5	(10.6)	
				0	(10.0)	
Miridae:						
Heterocordylus enythronhtalmus		_	6	(2.8)	_	1 (12)
			0	(2.0)	-	(1.2)
Cerambycidae						
Oberea nedemontana	2	(3.8)		-2	(4 3)	
	2	(0.0)		~	(ד.5)	
Frionbyidae						
Phyllocoptes annulatus	g	(173)				

Also recorded on Rhamnus alaternus (Malicky et al. 1970)

2)

3)

Also recorded on *R. orbiculata* (Malicky et al. 1970) Also recorded on *R. saxatilis* (Malicky et al. 1970) Also recorded on *R. saxatilis* (Malicky et al. 1970) Also recorded on *R. alpina* (Malicky et al. 1970; personal observations) 4)

5) Also recorded on Frangula rupestris (Malicky et al. 1970) patric sites have been recorded on *F. alnus* in sympatric sites, i.e. when given a proximate choice. In sympatric sites, *S. janiszewskae* and *G. rhamni* were the only species that were recorded more often on *F. alnus* than on *R. cathartica.* 

Preliminary screening tests with *P. vetulata*, *T. dubitata* and *T. walkeri*, confirmed host plant use observed in the field and the unsuitability of *F. alnus* for insect species associated with *Rhamnus* in their native range (unpublished data). In contrast, both *Rhamnus* and *Frangula* species were suitable hosts for the larvae of *A. apicella* and *S. stomoxiformis*, two species which were recorded on both buckthorns in Europe.

## 4. Discussion

Assessing the risk to non-target species by a biological control agent has been a fundamental part of classical biological weed control for many decades. When developing biological control for *R. cathartica* and *F. alnus*, minimizing the risk of potential non-target effects might require the selection of agents which are specific to either *R. cathartica* or *F. alnus*. Several of the European arthropod species commonly found in areas that were surveyed during this study are considered monophagous on *R. cathartica*, or oligophagous on species in the genus *Rhamnus*.

Among the leaf chewing species associated with the genus *Rhamnus*, a geometrid, *P. vetulata*, appears to be the most specialised. Among the gall formers and sap-suckers that have been studied so far, the leaf margin gall psyllid *T. walkeri* seems to be monospecific on *R. cathartica*. There is considerable interest in this species because it

attacks R. cathartica later in the season than P. vetulata. In North America, the high rate of seed production is an important element contributing to the invasiveness of R. cathartica (Knight et al., 2007). The seed-feeding midge, W. krumbholzi is considered a key candidate biocontrol agent because it could significantly reduce the seed production of common buckthorn in North America. The psyllids C. rhamnicolla and T. rhamni, the leaf miners S. catharticella, C. quadrisignella and B. rhamniella, the leaf chewers T. dubitata and P. transversata, and the mites A. rhamni and T. rhamni are probably specific to R. cathartica or to a few species in the genus Rhamnus and should be considered in a future phase of the project. With the possible exception of S. janizewskae, the few shoot borers and root borers associated with buckthorns in Europe lack host specificity at the genus level.

There are few genus-specific arthropods on F. alnus. Besides the leaf-hopper, Z. suavis, which was the most host-specific species found in this study, literature records indicate the existence of another five arthropod species known from F. alnus only. None of these were encountered during this study and additional surveys are needed to confirm their host ranges in the field in Europe. Current indications are that finding species-specific or genus-specific agents for biological control of F. alnus will be difficult.

Large numbers of herbivores are known to be associated with plants with larger geographical ranges (Lawton and Schroeder, 1977; Strong et al., 1984). *Rhamnus cathartica* and *F. alnus* have similar geographical distributions in Europe (Tutin, 1968), so range should not account for differences in the arthropod richness associated with the two

Table 3

Comparison of the frequency of occurrence of specialized buckthorn arthropods on *R. cathartica* and *F. alnus* in 59 allopatric and 20 sympatric sites (2002–05, Italy, Austria, Switzerland, Germany and the Czech Rep.)

	Allopatric sites		Sympatric sites			
Total No. of sites sampled:	32	27 Frangula alnus	20			
	Rhamnus cathartica		Rhamnus cathartica	Frangula alnus	R. cathartica and F. alnus	
	Number of sites (%) with:		Number of sites (%) with:			
Bucculatrix frangutella	4 (12.5)	4 (14.8)	1 (5.0)	_	2 (10.0)	
Sorhagenia janiszewskae	12 (37.5)	8 (29.6)		5 (25.0)	1 (5.0)	
Calybites quadrisignella	1 (3.1)	_	2 (10.0)	_	_	
Stigmella catharticella	1 (3.1)	_	1 (5.0)	_	_	
Stigmella rhamnella	_	_	1 (5.0)	_	_	
Acrobasis romanella	_	_	1 (5.0)	_	_	
Gonopteryx rhamni	1 (3.1)	14 (51.9)	2 (10.0)	3 (15.0)	4 (20.0)	
Philereme vetulata	6 (18.8)	_	8 (40.0)	_		
Philereme transversata	3 (9.4)	_	5 (25.0)	_	_	
Triphosa dubitata	17 (53.1)	_	5 (25.0)	_	_	
Ancylis apicella	3 (9.4)	5 (18.5)	1 (5.0)	1 (5.0)	1 (5.0)	
Ancylis derasana	3 (9.4)	2 (7.4)	2 (10.0)	_	1 (5.0)	
Cacopsylla rhamnicola	4 (12.5)		1 (5.0)	_	_	
Trichochermes walkeri	26 (81.3)	_	17 (85.0)	_		
Trioza rhamni	23 (71.9)	_	13 (65.5)	_	_	
Zygina suavis	_	3 (11.1)	_	2 (10.0)	_	
Oberea pedemontana	_		_	_	2 (10.0)	
Phyllocoptes annulatus	6 (18.8)	_	3 (15.0)	_		

species. Centers of diversification of weed tribes or genera, which in turn are reflected by the highest number of congeneric or contribal species, are known to be the richest source of suitable herbivore species on certain weeds (Wapshere et al., 1989). Several studies found that taxonomic relatedness contributed significantly, though slightly, to arthropod species richness (e.g. Lawton and Schroeder, 1977; Neuvonen and Niemelä, 1981; Kennedy and Southwood, 1984). This is because related plants are likely to have the same chemical and physical traits and so are more likely to share herbivore insect species. Thus, plants with close relatives in a region (low taxonomic isolation) should have more herbivore species than those growing in isolation. In a study on the species richness of phytophagous insects and mites associated with 25 native tree genera in Germany, Brändle and Brandl (2001) concluded however that the importance of taxonomic isolation affecting herbivore species richness remains ambivalent. Contradictory results may be the consequence of the degree of taxonomic isolation (genus vs tribe or family), or the origin of the plant species considered (native vs introduced), the level of specificity of the herbivores considered (specialist vs generalist) or whether only a subset of the arthropod community is included in the study.

The genera Rhamnus and Frangula are predominant in the Old World and New World, respectively. In Europe there are 23 Rhamnus taxa as compared to four Frangula taxa. Thus, it appears that the evolution of *Rhamnus* and Frangula in isolation has led to specialization of arthropods on Rhamnus and Frangula species, with only a few specialist species on F. alnus in its native range in Europe and few species which are equally associated with both buckthorn species. Although we did not consider other sources of variability in the species richness of the arthropod fauna, such as plant abundance, this work supports the hypothesis that the species richness of specialized herbivores on native trees is affected by the taxonomic isolation of their hosts. It also shows that the search for, and selection of, potential biological control agents for a target weed can be facilitated by studying the arthropod species associated with related host plants from different lineages in centers of diversification.

## Acknowledgments

We thank S. Izehvski, G. Fayvush, Ding Jianqing, A.M. Poswal, P. Baronio, N. Baldassari, A. Marini, H. Malicky, M. Tschirnhaus, C. Lambelet, R. Mayor, J.-P. Sorge, A. Bogenrieder, F. Schuhwerk, T. Le Bourgeois and A. Hampe for providing information on the distribution of buckthorn in Europe; S. Whitebread, B. Landry, J. Buszko, A. Haltrich, L.O. Hansen and R. Petanovic for providing information on arthropods associated with buckthorn; Z. Lastuvka, P. Lauterer, R. Bryner, M.J.W. Cock and M. Skuhrava for identifying most of the material collected on buckthorns; M. D'Alessandro for compiling literature data; E. Spiewak, B. Kiefer, T. Rheinhold, G. Maia, A. Appleton, G. Cortat, and C. Péré for their field and laboratory assistance. We acknolwdege M.J.M. Cock, A. McClay, R. DeClerck-Floate, K. Bolmgren and two anonymous reviewers for their most valuable comments on this manuscript. This project was funded by the United States Environmental Protection Agency—Great Lakes National Program Office, the Minnesota Environment and Natural Resources Trust Fund as recommended by the Legislative Commission on Minnesota Resources (LCMR), and by the Minnesota Department of Natural Resources.

#### References

- Amrine, J.W., Stasny, T.A.H., 1994. Catalog of the Eriophyoidea (Acarina: Prostigmata) of the world. Indira Publishing House, Michigan, USA, 804 pp.
- Baran, T., 1997. New record of Sorhagenia lophyrella (Douglas, 1846) (Lepidoptera: Cosmopterigidae) from Poland. Wiadomosci-Entomologiczne 16, 122 (in Polish).
- Barnes, H.F., 1951. Gall midges of economic importance. Gall Midges of Trees, vol. 5. Crospby Lockwood and Sons Ltd., London.
- Baronio, P., Marini, M., Sama, G., 1988. Studies on Oberea pedemontana Chevrolat 1856 (Coleoptera, Cerambycidae). Monti e Boschi 39, 45–52 (in Italian).
- Bergmann, A., 1952. Die Grossschmetterling Mitteldeutschlands. Jena, Urania Verlag GmbH.
- Bibby, T., 1983. Oviposition by the brimstone butterfly, *Gonepteryx rhamni* (L.), (Lepidoptera: Pieridae) in Monk's Wood, Cambridgeshire in 1982. Entomologists' Gazette 34, 229–234.
- Bittermann, J., 1997. Beitrag zur Kenntnis der Bionomie, Verbreitung und Gefährdung des Faulbaum-Glasflüglers Synanthedon stomoxiformis (Hübner, 1790). Bayern Beiträge zur Bayerischen Entomofaunistik 2, 131–139.
- Blackman, R.L., Eastop, V.F., 1994. Aphids on the World trees. An Identification and Information Guide. CAB International, Walllingford, 986 pp.
- Blaschke, P., 1914. Die Raupen Europas mit ihren Futterphflanzen. Grasers Verlag, Annaber Sachsen.
- Bolmgren, K., Oxelman, B., 2004. Generic limits in *Rhamnus* L. s.l. (Rhamnaceae) inferred from nuclear and chloroplast DNA sequence phylogenies. Taxon 53, 383–390.
- Brändle, M., Brandl, R., 2001. Species richness of insects and mites on trees: expanding Southwood. Journal of Animal Ecology 70, 491–504.
- Buhr, H., 1965. Bestimmungstabellen der Gallen (Zoo- und Phytocecidien) an Pflanzen Mittel und Nordeuropas. Band II. Veb Gustav Fischer Verlag, Jena.
- Buszko, J., 1992. Studies on the mining Lepidoptera of Poland. XII. Redescription of *Bucculatrix rhamniella* Herrich-Schäffer, 1855 (Bucculatricidae), with comments on its present distribution. Polskie Pismo Entomologiczne 61, 7.
- Catling, P.M., Porebski, Z.S., 1994. The history of invasion and current status of glossy buckthorn (*Rhamnus frangula*) in Southern Ontario. Canadian Field Naturalist 108, 305–310.
- Contarini, E., Garagnani, P., 1980. The cerambycids of the coastal pinewoods of *Ravenna* (Coleoptera). Memorie della Societa Entomologica Italiana 59, 49–57 (in Italian).
- Converse, C.K., 2001. Element Stewardship Abstract for *Rhamnus* cathartica, *Rhamnus frangula* (syn. *Frangula alnus*). The Nature Conservancy, Arlington, Virginia.
- Coulianos, C.-C., 1998. Annotated catalogue of the Hemiptera–Heteroptera of Norway. Fauna Norvegica 45, 11–40.
- de Freina, J.J., 1983. Studien ueber Biologie, Verbreitung, geographische Variabilitaet und Morphologie von *Gonepteryx farinose* (Zeller, 1847) nebst zusaetzlicher Erlauterung der Verbreitung und geographischen

Variabilitaet von *Gonepteryx rhamni* (Linne, 1758) in Kleinasien. Mitteilungen der Münchner Entomologischen Gesellschaft 72, 9–55.

- de Freina, J.J., 1997. Die Bombyces und Sphinges der Westpalaearktis, Band 4, Sesioidea: Sesiidae, EFW ed. Forschung & Wissenschaft, Verlag GmbH, München.
- Demelt, C. v., Franz, H., 1990. Ein systematisches Verzeichnis aller auf österreichischem Gebiet festgestellten Tierarten. Catalogus Faunae Austriae, vol. 15. Verlag der Oesterreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaft, Wien.
- Doczkal, D., Rennwald, E., 1992. Observations on the habits, distribution, and endangerment of the clearwing moth *Synanthedon stomoxiformis* (Huebner, 1790) in Baden-Wuerttemberg (Lepidoptera: Sesiidae). Atalanta Marktleuthen 23 (1–2), 259–274 (in German).
- Emmet, A.M., 1969. Discovery of the larva of *Sorhagenia rhamniella* Zeller. The Entomologist's Record 81, 20–21.
- Forster, W., Wohlfahrt, T.A., 1981. Die Schmetterlinge Mitteleuropas; Band 5: Spanner (Geometridae), Franckische Verlagshadlung, Stuttgart, 312 pp.
- Fox, L.R., Morrow, P.A., 1981. Specialization: species property or local phenomenon? Science, 887–893.
- Frisch, J., 1992. Ein neuer Bockkäfer für die Fauna Kärntens—Oberea pedemontana Chevrolat 1856 (Coleoptera, Cerambycidae). Carinthia II 182, 637–642.
- Frohawk, F.W., 1940. Food-plants of *Gonepteryx rhamni*. The Entomologist 73, 68–69.
- Gale, S.W., 2001. Control of the invasive exotic *Rhamnus cathartica* in temperate North America forests. <a href="http://www.hort.agri.umn.edu/h5015/00papers/gale.htm">http://www.hort.agri.umn.edu/h5015/00papers/gale.htm</a>>.
- Gassmann, A., Tosevski, I., Appleton, A., Cortat, G., Péré, C., Rheinhold, T., 2006. Biological Control of Buckthorns (*Rhamnus cathartica* and *Frangula alnus*). Report 2004–05, CABI Bioscience, Switzerland Centre, 62 pp.
- Gollner-Scheiding, U., 1972. Beiträg zur Heteropteren-Fauna Brandenburgs. 2. Übersicht über die Heteropteren von Brandenburg. Veroffentl. Veroffentl. Bizirksheimat Museum Potsdam (25/26), 5–39.
- Gourley, L.C., 1985. A study of the ecology and spread of buckthorn (*Rhamnus cathartica* L.) with particular reference to the University of Wisconsin arboretum. Department of Landscape Architecture, University of Wisconsin, Madison, Wisconsin, USA.
- Grubov, V.I., 1949. Monography of *Rhamnus* L. s.l. In: Schischkin, B.K. (Ed.), Flora et Systematica Plantae Vasculares. Academiae Scientiarum USSR, Leningrad, pp. 14–425.
- Gutierrez, D., Thomas, C.D., 2000. Marginal range expansion in a hostlimited butterfly species *Gonepteryx rhamni*. Ecological Entomology 25, 165–170.
- Haber, E., 1997. Invasive Exotic Plants of Canada. Fact sheet No. 6. Glossy Buckthorn—*Frangula alnus* P. Mill. <a href="http://info-web.magi.com/~ehaber/factcbck.htlm">http://info-web.magi.com/~ehaber/factcbck.htlm</a>>, National Botanical Services, Ottawa, ON, Canada.
- Hampe, A., Arroyo, J., Jordano, P., Petit, R.J., 2003. Rangewide phylogeography of a bird-dispersed Eurasian shrub: contrasting Mediterranean and temperate glacial refugia. Molecular Ecology 12, 3415–3426.
- Hannemann, H.-J., 1964. Kleinschmetterlinge oder Microlepidoptera. II. Die Wickler (s. l.) (Cochylidae und Carposinidae), die Zünselartigen (Pyraloidea). In: Dahl, F., Dahl, M., Peus, F. (Eds.), Die Tierwelt Deutschlands und der angrenzenden Meeresteile. 50. Teil. Gustav Fischer Verlag, Jena.
- Harder, D.E., Chong, J., 1983. Virulence and distribution of *Puccinia coronata* in Canada in 1982. Canadian Journal of Plant Pathology 5, 185–198.
- Heath, J. (Ed.), 1976. Moths and butterflies of Great Britain and Ireland. Vol. 1: Micropterygidae–Heliozelidae. Springer, Berlin.
- Heath, J., Emmet, A.M., 1985. The Moths & Butterflies of Great Britain and Ireland. Vol. 2: Cossidae–Heliodinidae. Harley Books, Colchester, UK.
- Heath, J., Emmet, A.M., 1989. The Moths & Butterflies of Great Britain and Ireland. Vol. 7: Hesperidae–Nympahlidae. Harley Books, Colchester, UK.

- Heidorn, R., 1991. Vegetation management guideline: exotic buckthorns—common buckthorn (*Rhamnus cathartica* L.), glossy buckthorn (*Rhamnus frangula* L.), *Dahurian buckthorn (Rhamnus davurica* Pall.). Natural Areas Journal 11, 216–217.
- Heie, O.E., 1986. The Aphidoidea (Hemiptera) of Fennoscandia and Denmark. III. Family Aphididae: subfamily Pterocommatinae & tribe Aphidini of subfamily Aphidinae. Fauna Entomologica Scandinavica, vol. 17. E.J. Brill/Scandinavian Science Press, Leiden, 314 pp.
- Hering, E.M., 1957. Bestimmungstabellen der Blattminen von Europa. Den Haag, Junk.
- Horion, A.D., 1974. Faunistik der Mitteleuropaeischen Kaefer. Cerambycidae. Bodensee, Ueberlingen.
- Houard, C., 1909. Les Zoocécidies des Plantes d'Europe et du Bassin de la Méditerrannée. Librairie Scientifique A. Hermann et fils, Paris.
- Ivinskis, P.P., Ionaitis, V., Petrauskas, V., 1982. 138 species of Lepidoptera new to the Lithuanian SSR, collected from 1968 to 1982. Novye-iredkie-dlya-Litovskoi-SSR-vidy-nasekomykh, pp. 28–47 (in Russian).
- Jacobi, K., Menne, B., 1991. Reproductive biology of the troglophilic looper moth *Triphosa dubitata* L. (Lepidoptera, Geometridae). Carolinea 49, 129–130.
- Johnston, M.C., Johnston, L.V., 1978. *Rhamnus*. In: Flora Neotropica Monograph 20. New York Botanical Garden, New York, pp. 1–96.
- Kennedy, C.E.J., Southwood, T.R.E., 1984. The number of species of insects associated with British trees: a re-analysis. Journal of Animal Ecology 53, 455–478.
- Knight, K.S., Kurylo, J.S., Endress, A.G., Stewart, J.R., Reich, P.B., 2007. Ecology and ecosystem impacts of common buckthorn (*Rham-nus cathartica*): a review. Biological Invasions 9, 925–937.
- Lawton, J.H., Schroeder, D., 1977. Effects of plant type, size of geographical range and taxonomic isolation on number of insect species associated with British plants. Nature 265, 137–140.
- Lekic, M., Mihajlovic, L., 1976. A contribution to the investigation of the ecology of *Oberea pedemontana* Chevrolat on *Rhamnus cathartica* as a host plant (in Serbian). Glasnik Sumarskog Fakulta Serbia 50, 67–72.
- Leonard, K.J., 2003. Regional frequencies of virulence in oat crown rust in the United States from 1990 through 2000. Plant Disease 87, 1301– 1310.
- Linnaeus, C. von, 1753. Species Plantarum. Holmiae, Impensis L. Salvii, vol. 1, pp. 193–195.
- Louda, S.M., Kendall, D., Connor, J., Simberloff, D., 1997. Ecological effects of an insect introduced for the biological control of weeds. Science 277, 1088–1090.
- Malicky, H., Sobhian, R., Zwölfer, H., 1970. Investigations on the possibilities of biological control of *Rhamnus cathartica* L. in Canada: Host ranges, feeding sites, and phenology of insects associated with European Rhamnaceae. Zeitschrift für angewandte Entomologie 65, 77–97.
- McKay, H.V., 1991. Egg-laying requirements of woodland butterflies; Brimstones (*Gonepteryx rhamni*) and alder buckthorn (*Frangula alnus*). Journal of Applied Ecology 28, 731–743.
- McLean, I.F.G., 1993. The host plant associations and life history of *Trichochermes walkeri* Förester (Psylloidea: Triozidae). British Journal of Entomology and Natural History 6, 4.
- Medan, D., 1994. Reproductive biology of *Frangula alnus* (Rhamnaceae) in southern Spain. Plant Systematics and Evolution 193, 173–186.
- Meyer, J., 1987. Plant Galls and Gall Inducers. Gebrüder Borträger, Berlin, Stuttgart.
- Michalska, Z., 1996. Nepticulidae (Lepidoptera) of Roztocze. Srodkowe Fragmenta Faunistica Warsaw 39, 61–69.
- Mihajlovic, L., 1978. First contribution to the knowledge of the superfamily Pyraloidea. Fauna of Serbia 2, 177–201.
- Miller, P., 1754 /1768. The Gardener's Dictionary, fourth ed., Bd. 1–3, Rivington, London (8th ed., published in 1768).
- Neuvonen, S., Niemelä, P., 1981. Species richness of macrolepidoptera on Finnish deciduous trees and shrubs. Oecologia 51, 364–370.
- Okopnyi, N.S., Poddubnyi, A.G., 1983. Mechanism of gall formation on leaves of buckthorn infected with psillid larvae *Rhamnus cathartica*

attacked by *Trichochermes walkeri*. Dokl. Bot. Sci. Akad. Nauk. SSSR (265/267), 114–117.

- Ossiannilsson, F., 1981. The Auchenorrhyncha (Homoptera) of Fennoscandinavia and Denmark. Vol. 7, Part 2: The families Cicadidae, Cercopidae, Membracidae, and Cicadellidae (excl. Deltocephalinae), Scandinavian Science Press Ltd., pp. 584–586.
- Ossiannilsson, F., 1992. The Psylloidea (Homoptera) of Fennoscandia and Denmark. Fauna Entomologica Scandinavica, 26.
- Pemberton, R.W., 2000. Predictable risk to native plants in weed biological control. Oecologia 125, 489–494.
- Pollard, E., Hall, M.L., 1980. Possible movement of *Gonepteryx rhamni* (L.) (Lepidoptera: Pieridae) between hibernating and breeding areas. Entomologist's Gazette 31, 217–220.
- Puplesis, R., 1994. The Nepticulidae of Eastern Europe and Asia: Western, Central and Eastern Parts. Leiden. Backhuys Publishers, The Netherlands.
- Puplyasis, R.K., 1984. Contribution to the knowledge of pigmy moths of the genus *Stigmella* Schrank (Lepidoptera, Nepticulidae) of Lithuania (in Russian). Acta Entomologica Lituanica 7, 72–85.
- Rameau, J.C., Mansion, D., Dumé, G., Timbal, J., Lecointe, A., Dupont, P., Keller, R., 1989. Flore forestière française. Guide écologique illustré. 1. Plaines et collines. Institut pour le Développement Forestier, Ministère de l'Agriculture et de la Forêt.
- Randall, J.M., Marnelli, J., 1996. Invasive plants: weeds of the global garden. Brooklyn Botanic Gardens, Inc., Brooklyn, NY, 111 pp.
- Razowski, J., 1970. Cochylidae. In: Amsel, H.-G., Gregor, F., Reisser, H. (Eds.), . Microlepidoptera Palaearctica, vol. 3. Verlag Georg Fromme & Co, Wien.
- Razowski, J., 2003. Tortricidae (Lepidoptera) of Europe. Vol. 2. Olethreutinae, Frantisek Slamka, Bratislava, 301 pp.
- Rippey, I., 1984. The purple hairstreak and brimstone butterflies in Northern Ireland. Entomologist's Gazette 35, 5.
- Scamoni, A., 1985. Ueber das ökologische und soziologische Verhalten von *Rhamnus cathartica* L. und *Frangula alnus* Mill. in der planaren Stufe der DDR. Feddes Repertorium 96, 139–144 (in German).

- Schmidt, K.A., Whelan, C.J., 1999. Effects of exotic *Lonicera* and *Rhamnus* on songbird nest predation. Conservation Biology 13, 1502–1506.
- Skinner, B., 1984. Colour Identification Guide to Moths of the British Isles (Macrolepidoptera), Viking.
- Spatenka, K., Gorbunov, O., Lastuvka, Z., Tosevski, I., Arita, Y., 1999. Handbook of Palaearctic Macrolepidoptera. Sesiidae—Clearwing Moths, vol. 1. Gem Publishing Company, Wallingford, England.
- Speight, M.C.D., Cogan, B.H., 1979. Agrometopia wahlbergi, Clusiodes caledonica and Stigmella catharticella: insects new to Ireland. Irish Naturalists' Journal 19, 401–402.
- Stadie, D., 1995. Lebensweise und Verbreitung des Kreuzdornglasflüglers Synanthedon stomoxiformis (Hübner, 1790) in Thüringen und Sachsen-Anhalt (Lep., Sesiidae). Entomologische Nachrichten und Berichte 39, 219–223.
- Stelter, H., 1975. Untersuchungen über Gallmücken XVIII. Wachtliella krumbholzi n. sp. in Fruchtgallen von Rhamnus cathartica L. (in German). Deutsche Entomologische Zeitschrift 22, 157–162.
- Strong, D.R., Lawton, J.H., Southwood, R., 1984. Insects on plants. Community Patterns and Mechanisms. Blackwell Scientific Publications, Oxford, 313 pp.
- Tutin, T.G., 1968. Rhamnaceae. In: Tutin, T.G., Heywood, V.H., Burges, N.A., Moore, D.M., Valentine, D.H., Walters, S.M., Wegg, D.A. (Eds.), Flora Europaea, vol. 2. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, MA, pp. 243–245.
- USDA/NRCS, 2001. The PLANTS Database, Version 3.1. <a href="http://plants.usda.gov">http://plants.usda.gov</a>>, National Plant Data Center, Baton Rouge, LA 70874-4490, USA.
- Voegtlin, D.J., O'Neil, R.J., Graves, W.R., Lagos, D., Yoo, H.J.S., 2005. Potential winter hosts of soybean aphid. Annals of the Entomological Society of America 98, 690–693.
- Wapshere, A.J., Delfosse, E.S., Cullen, J.M., 1989. Recent development in biological control of weeds. Crop Protection 8, 227–250.
- Zerova, M.D., Mamonatova, V.A., Ermolenko, V.M., Djakonchuk, L.A., Sinev, C.J., Kozlov, M.V., 1991. Nesekomie-Galloobrazovateli kulturnih i dekorastujusih rastenii evropeiskoi casti SSSR., Kiev Naukova Dumka.